Intersectionality at the Programmatic Level: UC Davis Institutional Transformation: Social Science Research Initiative ADVANCE program Workshop June 1, 2015 Baltimore, Maryland

Adela de la Torre, Co-PI
Professor of Chicana/o Studies
Director, Center for Transnational Health
Vice-Chancellor, Student Affairs

Yvette Flores
Professor of Chicana/o Studies

Laura Grindstaff
Professor of Sociology

Marylou de Leon Siantz
Professor of Nursing
Director, CAMPOS

Lisceth Brazil-Cruz
PhD School of Education
Post-doctoral scholar, ADVANCE
UC Davis ADVANCE Program goals

Institutional Transformation
- To implement programs and practices that reduce the impact of unconscious bias
- To promote diversity
- To openly review and revise personnel policies and practices.

Increase Diversity
– To increase recruitment, retention and advancement of female STEM ladder-rank faculty, with an emphasis on Latinas.

Promote STEM research
– To promote innovation in STEM fields and to develop a STEM workforce that more closely reflects the populations it serves.
Project Overview

- UC Davis ADVANCE Program initiatives

**Inclusive Campus Climate Initiative**
- Establish evidence-based programs to reduce impact of unconscious bias and promote diversity – Strength through Diversity and Equity (STEAD).

**Policy & Practices Review Initiative**
- Review and revise policies and practices that may inhibit career development among diverse STEM scholars.

**Mentorship & Networking Initiative**
- Develop an integrated series of programs based on the synergy between mentorship and networking that will enable UC Davis STEM faculty members to advance their careers and assume leadership positions.

**Social Sciences Research Initiative**
- Conduct a rigorous social science research and evaluation program that informs and investigates the effectiveness of several key elements of the other three initiatives.

**The Center for the Advancement of Multicultural Perspectives on Science (CAMPOS) Initiative**
- Establish a center that will attract women and Latina STEM scholars to our campus by providing an accessible and inclusive community of research collaborators and mentors throughout their careers.
Social Science Mission

To conduct empirical, qualitative research that...

1) identifies the personal and institutional factors influencing the career paths of Latina STEM scholars in academia.

2) informs the UC Davis ADVANCE program initiatives.

3) contributes to the literature explaining the under-representation of Latinas in STEM.
Study Cohorts

1. The President's Postdoctoral Fellowship Program (PPFP), 1988-present:
   - Total sample size of 537
   - 58 of the 537 fellows are Latina
   - 23 of the 58 Latina fellows are in STEM (10 interviewed)
   - 35 of the 58 Latina fellows are non-STEM (9 interviews)

2. CAMPOS Faculty Scholars 2014-2015
   - Sample size of 9 (7 interviewed)

3. Latina STEM scholars nationwide, in and outside academia
The University of California President’s Postdoctoral Fellowship Program was established in 1984 to encourage outstanding women and minority Ph.D. recipients to pursue academic careers at the University of California. The current program offers postdoctoral research fellowships, professional development and faculty mentoring to outstanding scholars in all fields whose research, teaching, and service will contribute to diversity and equal opportunity at UC.

**Resources for:**
- Applicants
- Fellows
- Faculty
- Universities
Methodology

• In-depth, semi-structured interviews
  1 – 2 hours in length
  Questions regarding: background, early education, PPFP program, Career path after PPFP, work environment, work-life balance, and future goals

• “Grounded theory” approach to qualitative analysis

• Narrative representation of themes and patterns

• Connections and additions to existing literatures
Demographic characteristics

• Of the 10 women for whom we have done initial coding and analysis
  – 6 were US born; 4 were immigrants
  – 1 was a child immigrant
  – 2 Immigrated for college or grad school {from Peru and Brazil}
  – 2 were mixed {European American/white and Mexican}
  – 3 described themselves as middle class
  – The rest were working class or poor
Interview Themes

• Early childhood experiences (home, school, neighborhood)
• Mentoring
• Structural and programmatic supports
• Role of family in pathway
• Work-life balance
• Conflicts/challenges
• Resilience
• Positionality
## ADVANCE Social Sciences Research
Preliminary Interview Themes

Impact Across Initiatives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inclusive Campus Climate</th>
<th>Mentorship &amp; Networking</th>
<th>Policy &amp; Practices</th>
<th>Dual Career Hiring</th>
<th>CAMPOS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Resilience</td>
<td>Mentorship Across the Lifespan</td>
<td>Institutional Supports</td>
<td>University and private industry opportunities for partner employment</td>
<td>Personal History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflict/Challenges</td>
<td>Structural &amp; Programmatic Supports</td>
<td>Current Family Situation</td>
<td>Mentorship Across the Lifespan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Work Life Balance</td>
<td></td>
<td>Structural and Programmatic Supports</td>
<td>Conflict/Challenges</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mentors

You must do the things you think you cannot do.  Eleanor Roosevelt

We don’t accomplish anything in this world alone...and whatever happens is the result of the whole tapestry of one’s life and all the weavings of individual threads from one to another that creates something.

Justice Sandra O’Connor

I’ll bet every one of us can identify a person who helped us get over the hump, stay in the profession, and really get excited about it.

Two or three people in my career –both men and women-have done that for me. Those of us that are more senior should be mentors.

Dr. Julie Shimer, Vice President of the technical staff and director of advanced custom technologies at Motorola, 1995
Mentors:
A Lifespan Perspective

- Childhood
- Community College
- Undergraduate
- Graduate
- Post-Doc
Mentorship Across the Lifespan

- Childhood/Family
  - Junior High School
  - High School

- Community College

- College

- Graduate School

- PPFP

- Employment
Mentorship Themes
Childhood Mentors

- **Mother**: Role model of perseverance: “One who loves and understands, communicates”
- **Father**: you don’t want to go through life with “what if” I had gone to graduate school you have this opportunity, try it.
- **Aunts**: Some of my dad’s sisters took me under their wings
- **Negative:**
  - My father even told my husband, years ago, that if he had to do it over again he wouldn’t have had us.
  - Very Harsh knocks I was able to stand up to (was alcoholic)
  - Kids in high school spit in my hair…spit in my face
- **I had a junior high school teacher**...he loved my work. I wrote in 9th grade a dissertation on Mexico. He loved it...used as an example in his class
- **High School teacher**: don’t think of four college years (overwhelming) ahead but what your homework is week to week and exams...the time will pass
Mentorship Themes: Community College Mentor

Professor he was a very **pivotal person** in my life....he was in charge of computer lab, double PhD, he’s one of the reasons I went into material science.

Professor was just this **high energy**, really enthusiastic ...found content teaching fascinating.

We had field trips connecting science to real world application of the concept talking about

**Had Conversations** about graduate school.
Mentorship Themes:
Undergraduate

- Mentee: It was my knowing I wanted to get involved with research that started it all...I reached out...said I wanted to do this...they were open and willing to mentor

- Inspirational: Freshman orientation....female professor...looking absolutely fabulous...walked in with slab of formaldehyde with a human brain on it in her lab coat...walked up to podium and said this is a brain....I got into her class and went to her office hours every week and we became very good friends

- Encouraging: Enjoyed class as Senior and professor...gave me a recommendation to go to Masters program at Davis

- They helped me make the transition from a working adult into a college student and really opened so many doors for me...my professors were amazing
Mentorship Themes: Undergraduate

• **Encouraging:** He was probably first person who told me, “you’re a really good writer

• First Latino Dean at Princeton...his door was always open

• **Analytical Skill Development:** My philosophy professor taught me how to think

• **Diverse Role Model:** I had a professor of color that really opened my eyes and gave me confidence

• All of these mentors saw something in the rough and would pull me out...they had really high standards that I had to cross
Mentorship Themes: Undergraduate

- **Role model**...professors writing grants...trying to get money to hire people do all the work that they thought about

- Person you go to for advice...you knew they were always there

- **Diverse role model**: I had a biracial teacher...he told me for biracial people, it’s very difficult, but if you get past the social stigma, they have many more talents than any given one race

- **Analytical Skill Development**: Always expected to do independent research in our junior year and as a senior thesis...why I had confidence to do independent work as a graduate student...I already had the experience

- **Negative Mentoring**
  - Could have benefitted from more guidance
  - My advisor was very hands off
  - I had very famous advisors but I didn’t think they were particularly caring
Mentorship Themes: Undergraduate

• Peer mentoring: Encouragement
  – I met a graduate student...a PhD student and he said to me “Oh so you’re graduating...you should apply to our dept. it’s really great. And that’s how I ended up applying to ethnic studies at Berkeley, because of the student I met
  
  – I heard of someone who had gotten into the President’s Post-Doc...her 2nd year..She kind of gave me the application and said ‘here’s my application you should apply, here’s what you need to say, here’s what you need to do” I was coached by my friend
Mentorship Themes: Undergraduate

- **Mentor characteristics: High Standards**
  - He really was kind of instilling very rigorous standards on the work
  - It was painful but I appreciated having my advisor be my strongest critic because if I were to learn that out in research world, I probably wouldn’t have been as successful as I am.
Mentorship Themes: Graduate School

Three kinds of mentors: PhD, Collaborating Mentors, Post-Doc Mentors

• PhD: Helped me with **connections** and networks and things like that

• **Role model** for faculty role I choose later...she embodied a lot of qualities I had and that if she could make it...she ended up in another path than academia, so walking that path was really hard

• Dissertation committee member...Came to UCLA, I asked him “Could I get a post-do with you and he said sure, “ I will write you a letter.”I did my post-doc in sociology...**Encouraging**
Mentorship Themes: Graduate School

• Had caring hands on mentor...always there to answer my questions...she met with me a lot
• Experience to **learning to juggle**
• **Publish** with my mentor
• What she did not give me with immediate contacts she made up with **insight**
• He helped me with my statement and she (peer) helped me with the whole PPFP application...**Encouraging**
Mentorship Themes: Graduate School

• **Negative Mentoring:**
  – My Advisor was very hands off
  – Assumed I did not have appropriate standards of rigor
  – The men I worked with were absolutely horrible human beings
  – I spent lots of time working to get fellowships...advisor said if I wrote sections he would fill in rest...he never followed through
  – He yelled at me because he did not have background to advise me
  – While working on my dissertation I was told “Oh, I didn’t think you would do that well.”
  – As soon as I got my PhD my former advisor started throwing all these barriers between us
  – In order to teach a class (with her former advisor) I would have to get people in college to vouch for the fact I could teach...she whittled it down
Mentorship Themes: Post-Doc

• **Academic Skill Development**
  – Collaborate
  – Co-Author

• If you need to work with her she’ll talk with you whatever time of night

• On vacation she snuck away to make sure everything was okay

• Things like calling her at 2 in the morning her time on the last grant we submitted

• Being constantly reminded of things that would be beneficial
Mentorship Themes: Post-Doc

• **Ideal: Emotional support and hands on**
  – A very young PI vs. experienced, older PI has less time
  – Need blend of both
  – Working on Grants strengthened our relationship
  – Brilliant, she’s very generous, and very giving, but she is not going to force me to do something...it has to come from me

• **Negative Mentorship:**
  – Things falling through the cracks
  – I got dropped from my insurance twice and didn’t even know it until I set my appointment
  – Two months into PPFP he completely dropped out of my life..never saw heard from him or anything
  – A professor was suppose to meet me for lunch ...to talk about my giving a presentation....I drove all the way up...she never showed up...I called her on the phone and she pretended she didn’t know anything about it
Mentorship Themes: Presidential Post-Doctoral Fellowship Program

• Peer mentors: Encouragement
  – we went to conferences together ...encouraged my research ” They’re just jealous of your work because it’s just so expansive and stuff...
  – I was in a hole and just didn’t have a clue what I wanted to do...she said why don’t you start a foundation for farm workers
Mentorship Themes: Presidential Post-Doctoral Fellowship Program

- **Academic Skill Development for Success**
  - She gave me insights and experimental viewpoints of things...constant feedback on my presentation materials, papers, etc. She was very helpful in my preparation for next step
  - End product was a very good paper
  - Negotiating: I got a lot more money because I became good at negotiating by contacting my mentors and asking what would I do and what did you do?

- **Mentor Characteristics: Finding the right match**
  - Someone who shows me respect
  - Open minded to different ways of thinking and doing
  - Collaboration based on sound expertise and knowledge
  - Visionary...we need to prepare her so we can bring her aboard because we need people like her
  - Most important PPFP mentor trait: “having a good mentoring relationship with someone who will continue to follow you throughout your career
  - He helped me with my cover letter
  - We had workshops on the job market
  - Would talk about how before you go on your job talk, you memorize names of faculty in the dept. and what they do
Mentorship Themes: Presidential Post-Doctoral Fellowship Program

• **Academic Skill Development for Success**
  – She’s very encouraging yet critical where she needs to be
  – Collaborating, co-authoring with her, if not her, others in PPFP program
  – Are readily available to give me advice on the interview process, on hiring process
  – Working with mentor on revising a course, so I will co-teach a class with him...
Mentorship Themes:
Presidental Post-Doctoral Fellowship Program

• **Positive Mentor Characteristics:**
  
  – **Positive Communication:**
    • He was nice and kind of soft
    • He was very easy with me wasn’t demanding ...sent me down a path where things got done
    • Super non-threatening, non-judgmental, gave proper guidance, pointed me in right direction
  
  – **Development of Academic Skills:**
    • Set up situations where I could get something out of it...like a publication...my most cited
    • Advised how to package ourselves, put resume together, some grant writing
Mentorship Themes: Presidential Post-Doctoral Fellowship Program

• Positive Mentor Characteristics
  – He was well known and I think, based on who’d be a great mentor, they’d probably be really pleased to get someone like him. I don’t know if it had anything to do with me.

  – PPFP Mentor...very busy, but when it comes to the important things he’s always there...one of them being job placement

  – He would not tell us how to do it ...he would just tell us what needed to be done... we had to figure it out

  – Learned “mean” values...be best you can be...you got a good idea, you get a funder, this is how it happens, write a grant

  – He loved taking an offer letter and saying exactly what I should ask for
Mentorship Themes:
Presidential Post-Doctoral Fellowship Program

• **Negative Mentor Characteristics:**
  
  – I owe him big...I took on the charge of bringing a conference of social-historical theorists against his advice...I wanted to have a day for him for all of the projects that he has had something to do with...and they would celebrate...he calls the committee and says “If (she) proceeds to do this, I’m going to go ...this is what I had to deal with

  – Negative Role Model: He provided a model in how you did not want to proceed with yourself, so maybe there is something useful there
Mentorship Themes: Employment Mentors

- Faculty position following post-doc: Employment CLIMATE
- Encouraging Administrative Leadership:
- My Dean has become another mentor for me
  - I asked him if he could approve for me to basically minimize my service and any other commitments because I really needed to devote to my papers because I have high quality data
  - He said, oh yes, it is infrastructural
  - Lack of communication resulted from negative incident, mentor kid of put up a distance after this event and rest of faculty failed to keep nurturing the other ones that came along not just me
  - Negative Mentoring: our dept. chair...I felt that she shamed me in faculty meetings for being pregnant
  - Positive: he just encourages me to focus on my work...he didn’t always get the differences in being a minority, but he really understands what it takes to get promoted...and tenure...navigating academia
  - To have other senior Latino faculty help me network and review my perspective...write letters
Mentorship: Key Points

• Mentors are important at all stages of Life Span

• Are Inspirational especially in the beginning of academic preparation

• Are positive or negative role models throughout lifespan

• For undergraduate and graduate students are
  – Encouraging
  – Analytical Skill builders
  – Research Skill developers
  – Open doors into continuing graduate education
Post Doc: Key Points

• For Post-Doc
  – Hands On
  – Academic Skill Development for future roles
  – Peer Mentors offer encouragement to each other
PPFP Key Points

• Right Match needed
• Build Academic Skills for future success
• Always there for important things
• Guides employment process/job market
• Negative: undermines PPFP success
Academic Employment Mentorship

Key Points

• Supportive University/department Climate important
• With Encouragement of Administrative Leadership starting with Dean

• QUESTIONS
• DISCUSSION